Preemption and public health: How significant is the impact?
Committee on Childhood Obesity Prevention, Institute of Medicine
Beckman Center, Monday, March 28, 2011

Mark Pertschuk
Project Director
Preemption and Movement Building in Public Health
Preemption

Preemption: When a higher level of government eliminates or limits the authority of a lower level by legislative or regulatory action.

Federal: *Supremacy Clause.*

[T]he Laws of the United States ... shall be the supreme Law of the Land; ... any Thing in the ... Laws of any State to the contrary notwithstanding. 
US Constitution Article VI.

State: Generally have the same broad preemption powers as Congress.
Federal and State Preemption

*Express* preemption: When a law contains a preemption clause or other preemptive language.

*Implied* preemption: When a court finds that a law is preemptive even in the absence of an express preemption clause.

*Savings Clause.* “Nothing in this law preempts more restrictive state or local regulation or requirements.”
Preemption in Public Health
Key Informant Interviews 2010

- Eighteen key informants, including:
  - Advocates
  - Researchers
  - Community organizers
  - Public officials

- In person, February – April 2010

- Recorded; transcribed; XSight
PMBPH Key Informants 2010

- Alcohol
- Tobacco
- Gun violence prevention
- Reproductive health
- Healthcare
- Drug policy
- Education
- Farm worker health
- LGBT youth
- HIV/AIDS
- Public health Infrastructure
- Obesity prevention
- Land use
- Environmental justice
- Clean and safe ports
- School food
- Fire prevention
- CAFO’s
- Indoor tanning facilities
Research Questions

- Impact of preemption on public health
- Impact of preemption on movement building
  - What is a grassroots public health movement and how does movement building benefit public health?
- Are the consequences of preemption universal?
- Industry role in preemption
- Transparency in negotiating preemption
All 18 key informants believed that preemption has a **negative impact** on public health:

- Limits innovation
- Takes away the ability of communities to respond to arising or diverse needs
- Takes away the incentive to organize and act at the local (or state) level
- “Hands over control” of a public health issue to industry lobbyists at the federal or state levels (where they have greater influence)
- Undermines grassroots movement building
- Bypasses the federal vision in which states function as “laboratories of experiment”
Impact of Preemption

• “[Preemption is] completely antithetical to the basic tenet of public health, which is that the national policy is there to set the floor....”

• “It’s hugely important .... Because if express preemption doesn’t exist, then implied preemption will exist. And industries are enormously creative and tireless in raising preemption arguments.”

• “It strikes me as universal.”

- PMB Key Informant Interviews 2010
When Preemption is Appropriate

- Preemption in public health can be appropriate in the *rare case* of a comprehensive national or international regulatory infrastructure that *by its essential nature* is national or international in scope.

- Example: the Airline Smoking Ban.
  - Aircraft pass rapidly from one jurisdiction to another, so differing laws in states could subject commercial flights to laws that change several times an hour.
  - High political incentives to adopt effective safety rules.
  - A strong, comprehensive system of federal rules makes sense.
Preemption in Tobacco Control

• “NEVER AGREE TO PREEMPTION. ... Preemption is unacceptable and should be avoided at all costs.”

• “The AHA opposes federal preemption of state and local statutes and state preemption of local statutes.”

• “Preemption locks in the status quo... But as time passes, standards change, and measures that once seemed out of the question become politically possible.”
Repealing Preemption

States with Any Type of Preemption of Smokefree Air Laws
American Nonsmokers' Rights Foundation
April 1, 2010

Preemption

Yes

No

CT, FL, NH, OK, PA, and SD have total preemption of smoking legislation.
MI preempts local laws relating to restaurants and bars.
NE preempts local laws relating to cigar bars.
NC: Local laws enacted/effective before 10/15/93 remain in force, but may not be strengthened. Local laws after that date may regulate smoking in local gov't buildings & specified public places. Local laws may regulate smoking in local gov't vehicles.
TN preempts entire field of regulations except for regulation in public buildings by cities and counties, airport authorities, utility districts, and special school districts.
UT preempts local laws other than those restricting smoking in public outdoor areas.
VA: Local laws enacted prior to 1/1/80 are not preempted. Other local laws may require nonsmoking sections in public places and may allow employers to regulate smoking in private workplaces.
WI preempts local laws restricting smoking in public places, except those laws applying only to public property.
Welcome to the Georgia Restaurant Association

Menu Labeling

What You Need To Know

June 29, 2010
Need for Federal Legislation

State and local menu labeling legislation

December 2006
STATE & LOCAL MENU LABELING PROPOSALS
As of May 2010

Menu labeling legislation enacted
Menu labeling legislation introduced
Menu labeling legislation defeated
Menu labeling legislation anticipated
Menu labeling legislation effective

* The Nashville/Davidson County Metropolitan Board of Health menu labeling regulations have been preempted by state law and are void.

** Nassau Co. legislature repealed the county menu labeling ordinance (May 2010)
# Nutrition Disclosure Law

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>LEAN Act (Carper/Murkowski)</th>
<th>MEAL Act (Harkin/DeLauro)</th>
<th>New Law</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Applies Too</strong></td>
<td>20 or more (Nationally)</td>
<td>20 or more (Nationally)</td>
<td>20 or more (Nationally)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information Required on the Menu, Menu Board and Drive Thru</strong></td>
<td>Information Available Upon Request</td>
<td>Calories Sodium Saturated Fat Trans Fat</td>
<td>Calories Additional Information Available Upon Request</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Federal Preemption</strong></td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Liability Protections</strong></td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“The Federal law does not preempt ‘a State law that provides greater protections to employees...’”    29 U.S.C. 207(r)(4)

DEPARTMENT OF LABOR: Request for Information from the public, Dec. 2010

“Throughout our history, State and local governments have frequently protected health, safety, and the environment more aggressively than has the national Government.”

“The purpose of this memorandum is to state the general policy of my Administration that preemption of State law by executive departments and agencies should be undertaken only with full consideration of the legitimate prerogatives of the States ...”

Grassroots Public Health Movements

- An organized effort to address threats to the health and safety of the community, led by activated citizens and organizations that devote resources to building grassroots capacity.

- Usually built around a single issue or concern that energizes individuals who join in common cause.
Grassroots Movement Defined

- “Residents and those who are directly impacted by an issue are ... making change and taking leadership.”

- “[I]t’s not just one local community struggling through that but our struggles are related, connected; and that we have a broad view about how to move a landscape in fixing the conditions that are similar....”

- “A grassroots movement [is] people organizing at the local level to bring about change on a particular issue.... And sometimes that starts at the community level and grows to a state level movement or a national movement or even a global movement.” (PMB Key Informant interviews 2010)
Benefits of Grassroots Movement Building

- Grassroots Movement
  - Power
    - Policy Change
    - Innovation
  - Public Education
    - Social Norms Change
    - Compliance
  - Civic Engagement
    - Trust
    - Social Capitol
  - Capacity
    - Sustainability
The Impact of Preemption on Grassroots Movement Building

- Preemption has a negative impact on grassroots movement building.

- “[T]here's far less incentive for people to organize and act because they don't have an opportunity to take action at the local level.”

- “[O]ne of the biggest detriments to building grassroots is people answering you saying, ‘There isn’t anything we can do about that.’ [So if] the government has already said, ‘You’re right, you can’t do anything about this,’ then I’m much less likely to be able to move them to action.”

- PMB Key Informant Interviews 2010
Mark Pertschuk
Preemption and Movement Building in Public Health

415-250-8260
pertschuk@gmail.com
www.PMBPH.org